LAURA WILDMAN, PE

Director, New England Regional Office Fisheries & Water Resource Engineer **Princeton Hydro**

w: 860-652-8911 c: 860-989-7966 lwildman@princetonhydro.com



DANREMONAL DANNED (BY SOME) IF YOU DO DANNED FYOU DON'T

- Why Remove Dams?
- How We Analyze Dams for Removal
- What We are Learning Through a Wide Diversity of Case Studies
- Potential Differences Between Dam Removal in the USA and Europe



WHY REMOVE DAMS?

IS DAM REMOVAL JUST "CRAZY TALK" FROM HOPELESS ENVIRONMENTAL DREAMERS?



1975 fiction on

environmental vigilantes

John Muir's quote placed on the O'Shaughnessy Dam in 1987

Henry David Thoreau "A Week on the Concord and Merrimack Rivers" 1849 (1839 paddle)

Poor shad! Where is thy redress? When Nature gave thee instinct, gave she thee the heart to bear thy fate? Still wandering the sea in thy scaly armor to inquire humbly at the mouths of rivers if man has perchance left them free for thee to enter...armed only with innocence and a just cause...I for one am with thee, and who knows what may avail a crow-bar against that Billerica Dam?



You do what for a living? Why would you want to remove a dam, they are so pretty?

IS DAM REMOVAL JUST "CRAZY TALK"



Princeton Hydro

Laura AS Wildman, P.E.

Fisheries & Water Resource Engineer

Remover of Waterfalls

931 Main Street South Glastonbury, CT 06073

> t. 860.652.8911 m. 860.989.7966

lwildman@princetonhydro.com www.princetonhydro.com

Rainbow Removal and Unicorn Extermination at no extra charge

THE PUBLIC DOESN'T HAVE THE SAME ATTITUDE WHEN IT COMES TO REMOVING ABANDONED BUILDINGS AND BRIDGES





Lower Case Pond Dam, CT

We DID remove this breached industrial dam that was actively undermining a sewer line







We are NOT trying to remove Hoover Dam (well maintained, iconic, multiple purposes)

We ARE trying to remove this abandoned, sediment filled dam





NO

Lake Wyola Dam, MA

We ARE trying to remove this environmentally damaging dam with no economic purpose



NO

We are NOT trying to remove this recreational dam with multiple lakeside homes, even though it has significant safety hazards

Wonoosquatucket River Dam, RI

Bartlett Water Supply Dam, AZ

We DID remove this environmentally damaging dam and built a new water intake for the factory And not just because my grandfather built it

We are NOT trying to remove active water supply dams (or flood control dams)

NO

Great Works Dam, ME

Why Remove Dams?

1. Economic

- Loss of original purpose
- Maintenance (i.e. dam safety regulations)
- No longer economically justified

2. Dam Safety

- Aging dam structure
- Reservoir sedimentation
- Dam failure
- Attractive nuisance
- Liability

3. Environment

- Environmental impact is too great
- Proactive restoration (river, fish, WQ, sediment, etc.)







- National Inventory of Dams >87,000 Dams (>25 ft w/ 15ac-ft capacity or >6ft w/ 50ac-ft capacity)
- ~99,000 Dams regulated by states & in the USFWS Barrier Database
- Potentially Several Million Dams Status Report on the Nation's Floodplain Management Activity, 1989

DAMS ARE AGING & MAINTENANCE COSTS ARE RISING





- The vast majority of dams in the US are privately owned
- US Dam Safety Regulations require that most dams be maintained
- # of deficient dams in the US is increasing faster than repairs
- \$57 billion needed to repair dams (2013 Dam Report Card ASDSO)

Source: Association of State Dam Safety Officials from The Cost of Rehabilitating Our Nation's Dams: A Methodology, Estimate, and Proposed Funding Mechanism and http://www.infrastructurereportcard.org/dams/

MAINTAINING DAMS IS NOT AS FUN AS BUILDING OR REMOVING THEM

"Infrastructure is like Legos, building is fun, destroying is fun, but a Lego maintenance set would be the most boring $\#\%^{O!}$ toy in the world.

It comes built and then you maintain it, and if you do it right nothing happens and eventually you die." *John Oliver, Last Week Tonight*



BUT UNFORTUNATELY WE DON'T HAVE A GIANT BORED CHILD WATCHING OVER ALL OF OUR DAMS



DAMS FAILURES ARE ON THE RISE IN THE U.S.A.





Free Flowing River

- Natural Streambed Features / Substrate / Habitat
- Turbulent Flow Patterns
- Natural Temperature & Flow Regime
- Natural Transport of Sediments (suspended and bed load)
- Natural Transport of Debris & Nutrients
- Fish / Aquatic Organism Passage



- Traps Sediment
- Pollutants Accumulate in Sediment
- Blocks Fish Passage

- Creates Nutrient Starved Conditions Downstream
- Alters Downstream Flow Regime
- Creates Sediment Starved Conditions Downstream / Riverbed Degrades

CASCADING ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS OF DAMS





BUT WITH DAM REMOVAL, COMES CONTROVERSY

Billerica Dam, Concord River, MA



Henry David Thoreau was the surveyor for the farmers battling to remove the dam in 1861. Henry French pleads with the Massachusetts Legislature, 1861:

"For generations, a painful and expensive controversy has existed in relation to [the Billerica Dam], and if [not removed now], the children and children's children of these parties will be cursed with strife and contention"

DAMN IF YOU DO, DAMMED IF YOU DON'T As Predicted the Children and Children's Children Are Certainly Cursed with Strife and Contention







Winnemem Wintu Tribe war dance to protest Shasta Dam







"But not all of my job is about getting yelled at in public meetings"

ANALYZING DAMS FOR REMOVAL

Issues Assessed

ENGINEERING

DATA COLLECTION TYPE & CONDITION OF DAM (dam safety) SCALE OF PROJECT SITE LIMITATIONS (Topo., Encroachment, etc.) UPSTREAM & DOWNSTREAM IMPACTS UTILITIES/INFRASTRUCTURE SCOUR ASSESSMENT PROJECT PERMITTING ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS FIELD WORK AND CONDITIONS (survey, probes, photographs, resource delineation, etc.) ENGINEERING COST ESTIMATES

HYDROLOGIC

WATERSHED HYDROLOGY FLOODWATER STORAGE / ATTENUATION IMPOUNDMENT DRAWDOWN/DEWATERING WELL IMPACTS GAUGING

HYDRAULIC

CHANNEL HYDRAULICS (& safety) FLOODPLAIN HYDRAULICS FLOODING IMPACTS ICE JAMS WATER INTAKES & DIVERSIONS FLOOD MAPPING REVISIONS

FLUVIAL GEOMORPHIC

TESTING (probes, borings, samples) SEDIMENT QUANTITY & QUALITY SEDIMENT STABILITY/TRANSPORT SEDIMENT MANAGEMENT SEDIMENT DISPOSAL CHANNEL MORPHOLOGY/DESIGN (equilibrium slope, form, function, process, materials, geomorphic assessment) GEOLOGY/BEDROCK/GRADE CONTROLS TRIBUTARY IMPACTS REFERENCE REACHES SITE RESTORATION

SOCIOECONOMIC

WHY REMOVE A DAM? OWNERSHIP (Water Rights; Easements) & BUY-IN ABUTTERS & OTHER USERS CURRENT USES & ALT. USES (hydro., navigation, flood control, water supply, recreation, etc.) AESTHETICS (mud flats, water fall, fear of unknown) RECREATION LIABILITY & PUBLIC SAFETY ECONOMIC ISSUES & ANALYSIS FUNDING ARCHEOLOGICAL/HISTORICAL SENTIMENTAL VALUE PRESS & POLITICS

ECOLOGICAL

FISH: DIADROMOUS/RESIDENT/PASSAGE AQUATIC HABITAT HABITAT CONNECTIVITY ECOLOGICAL STUDIES & INTERCONNECTIONS VEGETATION / PLANTING PLANS REGULATED RESOURCES (i.e. wetlands, wildlife invasives, etc.) SPECIES OF SPECIAL CONCERN

WATER QUALITY

CHEMICAL PROPERTIES PHYSICAL PROPERTIES (i.e. temperature, turbidity) PUBLIC HEALTH REGULATORY TRIGGERS, i.e. TOTAL DAILEY MAXIMUM LOADS (TMDLs)

CONSTRUCTION

SEASONAL CONSTRUCTION LIMITS/WEATHER CONSTRUCTION ACCESS CONSTRUCTION SEQUENCE WATER CONTROL CONSTRUCTABILITY EROSION & SEDIMENT CONTROL WORKING IN WET VS DRY CONSTRUCTION COST PROTECTING UTILITIES BONDING INSPECTION & OVERSIGHT PRESS & THE PUBLIC UNKNOWNS

- Identify project goals (i.e. fish passage, dam safety, water quality, etc.)
- Review/discuss all potential project issues (to determine what the key issues are)
- Determine ownership (dam, land & water rights)
- Investigate available
 site data

The Heminway Pond Transition From 1934 to 2011 Watertown, CT





• Conduct a field investigation





Identify infrastructure/utilities that could be impacted



- Conduct topographic, bathymetric and cross sectional surveys (often with monumenting)
- Delineate regulated resources (i.e. wetlands)
- Create base mapping



Determine if any threatened or endangered species could be impacted



- Conduct sediment probes and testing (chemical and physical)
- Develop a sediment management plan

Conduct a historical/archeological review

• Analyze **hydrologic and hydraulic** conditions and develop a **water surface profile model** (existing and proposed conditions)

Assess alternatives

- Prepare a design report
- Develop engineering design plans
- Develop a construction cost estimate (and technical specifications of going to bid)

- Conducts public outreach/meetings
- Obtain regulatory permits

Conduct Construction Oversight

THIS DATA CAN THEN BE USED AS THE PRE-REMOVAL DATA SETTING US UP FOR POST-REMOVAL MONITORING

DETAILED: When funds are available RESOURCE MANAGEMENT FOCUSED: When funds are not available



8 CRITICAL PARAMETERS

A set of common monitoring parameters viewed by workshop participants as necessary to <u>adequately assess the physical, chemical, and biological response</u> of a stream reach to a barrier removal project.

STREAM BARRIER REMOVAL MONITORING GUIDE

- Monumented cross-sections
- Longitudinal profile
- Grain size distribution
- Photo stations
- Water quality

Parameters have wide applicability

Process is generic and transferable to other regions

- Riparian plant community structure
- Macroinvertibrates
- Fish passage assessment

http://www.gulfofmaine.org/streambarrierremoval/

Monumented Cross-section as the "skeleton"



For:

- Longitudinal profile
- Grain size distribution
- Photo stations
- Water quality
- Riparian plant
 community structure



http://www.gulfofmaine.org/streambarrierremoval/

Monumented Cross-section as the "skeleton"



For:

- Longitudinal profile
- Grain size distribution
- Photo stations
- Water quality
- Riparian plant
 community structure



http://www.gulfofmaine.org/streambarrierremoval/

USGS Powell Center: Review and Synthesis of Dam Removal Research in the US Gathered 600 dam removal studies – Analyzed 139 US studies with empirical data



USGS Powell Center: Review and Synthesis of Dam Removal Research in the US Gathered 600 dam removal studies – Analyzed 139 US studies with empirical data



New England Sustainability Consortium - The Future of Dams (NEST) For Information Contact: David Hart, Director, Mitchel Center for Sustainable Solutions

- \$6 million grant from the National Science Foundation
- 4-year study examining the future of dams in New England.

Looks at potential dam options:

- maintaining existing hydropower dams,
- expanding hydropower capacity,
- removing aging dams to restore fisheries or reduce safety risks

By examining:

- economic,
- environmental, and
- social tradeoffs

To help make better decisions about dams



http://umaine.edu/mitchellcenter/road-to-solutions/new-england-sustainability-consortium/the-future-of-dams-nest/



IEARNING THROUGH A WIDE DIVERSITY OF CASE STUDIES

NO TWO DAM REMOVALS ARE THE SAME

Type of Dam Earth Gravity **Stone Masonry Timber Crib** Arch Stop Log Concrete Reinforced or Not Slab and Buttress Inflatable Rubber Other

Use Water Supply Navigation Water Level Control Flood Control **Fire Suppression** Recreational Hydro Electric Irrigation Tailings Grade Stabilization Fish & Wildlife No Use Other

Site Specific Issues Wide/Narrow Reservoir Urban or Rural **Highly Managed Delta Deposited** Quantity of Sediment **Historic Operation** Legacy Thalweg **Quality of Sediment** Layered Deposit Legacy Dam **Coarse or Fine Grained Bedrock or Vegetation** Infrastructure Impacted

Issues Associated with Impacts System Sensitivity **Sensitive Species** Entrenched Water Quality **Transport Capacity Social Perception** Scale Historic Cost/Funding



Tannery Brook Dam, New Hampshire

- 8.5m earthen dam
- Wide impoundment
- Little impounded
 sediment
- Passive channel treatment









5 Dams on the Naugatuck River, Connecticut

Chase Brass

Concrete Dam height = 2m length = 53m

Anaconda

Timber crib / Sheetpile Dam height = 4m length = 109m

Freight Street

Concrete / Sheetpile Dam height = 1m length = 53m



Platts Mill

Stone Rubble / Timber Crib height = 3n length = 77m



Union City

Timber Crib Dam height = 2.5m length = 63m



- 5 Dams Removed
- 70% of Watershed now free flowing
- Revival of an industrial river

5 Dams on the Naugatuck River, Connecticut



Pizzini Dam, Connecticut

- 1m high stone masonry dam
- No sediment
- Threatened mussel species
 downstream
- 3 years to permit
- 10 min to remove



Lamprey & mussel relocation post removal



Tel-Electric Dam, Massachusetts

- 5m concrete capped stone masonry dam
- Significant infrastructure: 2 active railroad bridges; 1 abandoned railroad bridge to be removed, factories, retaining walls, etc.
- Contaminated sediments throughout river
- 1 recent death



Edwards Dam, Maine

7.3m high hydropower dam

• **1997:** Edwards Dam marked the first time that FERC had ever denied an application for relicensing and set a precedent for FERC's authority to remove dams that pose greater harm than good. One year after removal in 1999 alewife returned by the millions for the first time in 160 years.





Penobscot River Dams, Maine

- FERC Settlement
- Hydro & Environmental Balancing: removed 2 dams increased power on two others







Penobscot River Dams, Maine



before

Saccarappa Dam, Maine

- Active hydro-electric; economically infeasible w/ fish passage prescription
- 2 concrete spillways with bedrock excavated tailrace; 2 bedrock falls; significant site modification
- Removal ≠ Fish Passage



Kent Dam, Ohio

- Historic Site
- Creative solution: portion of dam retained to create falling water aesthetic



Kent Dam, Ohio

- Historic Site
- Creative solution: portion of dam retained to create falling water aesthetic





Elwha River Dams, Washington

- Tribal rights
- Passage Critical: Listed
 salmon species
- Active hydropower
- ~21 million m³ of impounded sediment allowed to transport downstream
- Significant infrastructure improvements needed







Elwha Dam, WA (~37m high)



Glines Canyon Dam, WA (~62m high)

Milltown Dam, Montana

- 10m high timber crib and concrete, hydroelectric dam
- Superfund site
- 5 million m³ of contaminated sediment
- Much of the sediment relocated on site and capped in place





Heminway Dam, Connecticut

- Originally dredged impoundment
- Sediment filled impoundment now considered wetland
- Difficult permitting sediment relocation within former impoundment



San Clemente Dam, California

- Hydropower Dam: economically infeasibly to repair seismic and hydrologic deficiencies
- Unique bypass alternative to deal with sediment



San Clemente Dam, California

- Hydropower Dam: economically infeasibly to repair seismic and hydrologic deficiencies
- Unique bypass alternative to deal with sediment



Cumberland Dam, Maryland

- Historic bridge& canal
- Need to modify
 5.2 MGD water
 intake for
 historic canal
 (\$200-\$500K)
- Dioxins in sediment



Green River Dams, Massachusetts

- Cascading infrastructure impacts due to geomorphic instabilities
- Timber crib dam, not what it appeared to be
- Submerged knickpoint due to river avulsion per-dam construction





Cuddebackville Dam, New York

• Threatened Dwarf Wedge mussel species, needed to be identified, tagged, relocated



Brave Dam, Pennsylvania

A typical impoundment?



Brave Dam, Pennsylvania

A typical impoundment? No, the worlds largest radiator!



Dunkard Creek Dam, PA - Turn of the century cooling systems for a gas pumping station

Canton Dam, Connecticut

- Dam removal blocked due to future desire to develop small hydro – decades into process
- Is there potential to look into other micro-hydro options?







POTENTIAL DIFFERENCES BETWEEN USA AND EUROPE

HOW KEY ISSUES MAY DIFFER IN EUROPE

- Multiple countries in Europe vs. multiple states in U.S.
- <u>Different regulations</u> that will define different "key" issues (i.e. wetlands may not be as big of a regulatory issue, but historic or water rights may play a larger role)
- Stakeholders are at a <u>different</u> <u>stage in the evolution</u> of the concept of restoring river connectivity through dam removal
- <u>Engrained "vision</u>" of a tamed or controlled landscape with dams



HOW KEY ISSUES MAY DIFFER IN EUROPE

- Small dams are often referred to as weirs, not dams
- Highly manipulated and "managed" systems
- <u>Harder to obtain a "natural</u>" approach
- Indicators such as an <u>equilibrium slope</u> may be less relevant
- Many small dams may be acting as grade controls (potentially in series)
- Long <u>history of infrastructure</u> that could now be impacted with removal
- Different invasive species and water <u>chemistry</u> issues


BEWARE: EUROPE HAS A HIGHER PERCENTAGE OF UNICORN HABITAT



THANK YOU

Laura Wildman, PE Princeton Hydro w: 860-652-8911 c: 860-989-7966 Iwildman@princetonhydro.com